

Louisiana National Register Review Committee Meeting

August 1, 2019, 11:00AM
Capitol Park Welcome Center
702 N. River Rd
Baton Rouge, Louisiana

Minutes

Chairman Lynn Lewis called the August 1, 2019, regular meeting of the National Register Review Committee to order at 11:07AM. In addition to Mr. Lewis, members present included Ava Allmont, Tarah Arcuri, Guy Carwile, Turry Flucker, Martha Salomon, Dr. Rebecca Saunders, Dr. Matthew Savage, and John Sykes.

Mr. Lewis asked for a motion to approve the agenda. Martha Salomon so moved and Tarah Arcuri seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Carrie Broussard welcomed the members of the public to the meeting and introduced Emily Ardoin, the National Register Coordinator.

Mr. Lewis asked for a motion to approve the minutes from April's meeting. Ms. Salomon so moved and Dr. Saunders seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Emily Ardoin welcomed the audience and committee members to the meeting. She also introduced all of the committee members.

Under New Business, 8 nominations were presented to the committee.

Lake Charles Historic District Boundary Increase I, Calcasieu Parish Presented by Kelly Calhoun, nomination preparer

The Lake Charles Historic District was listed in the National Register in 1990 under Criteria A and C. The proposed boundary increase adds one contributing and one noncontributing building to the district. Built c. 1900 as a single-family structure in the Queen Anne Style, 517 Broad Street was remodeled in the Colonial Revival style in 1940 a few years after it became a funeral home. Its contribution as a Colonial Revival building marks it an important historic asset to the Lake Charles Historic District. Though 517 Broad was adapted from a Queen Anne residence, its Colonial Revival transformation was extensive. 517 Broad is consistent with the character of the district and contributes to its architectural significance as a later example and one of the most prominent Colonial Revival examples in the district. The house fits the sub-type "Classical Colonial Resources" in the Louisiana historic context for the Colonial Revival style in its rectangular and symmetrical form, materials including brick veneer, and other elements including fenestration, doors, columns, and one-story side wing. The asymmetrical porches were removed to reveal the rectangular shape of the building, and three of the four façades were covered in brick. The asymmetrical primary façade of the Queen Anne residence was reworked, and the renovated façade is symmetrical with paired windows and a Palladian door at the main entrance. A two-story full-width porch was added with Tuscan columns and corresponding square pilasters at the outer edges of the facade. The columns support a separate flat roof with a prominent dentillated cornice. The porte cochere was replaced with a side wing with a prominent first story, presenting itself as a one-story side wing typical of Colonial Revival residences. Despite retaining a few of its original elements, 517 Broad presents itself as a fully Colonial Revival building and contributes to the significance of the district under Criterion C in the Colonial Revival category.

Guy Carwile asked why the building was not included in the original district. Ms. Calhoun responded that the building might have been excluded due to the significant alterations. Lynn Lewis asked what buildings are included between the boundary expansion and the original boundary. Ms. Calhoun responded that this area includes a 1990 courthouse and a 1970-1980 building, both outside the period of significance. Guy Carwile requested a correction of a discrepancy in address numbering between maps and requested that a floor plan

of the funeral home be included in the nomination. John Dees and Winnie Guillory spoke in support of the nomination with Ms. Guillory noting that the city of Lake Charles had passed a resolution in favor of the nomination.

Dr. Saunders then moved that the nomination be recommended to the SHPO and Turry Flucker seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

All Saints Roman Catholic Church and School, Orleans Parish

Presented by Eurydice Bush-Harrison, co-nomination preparer

The All Saints Roman Catholic Church and School were part of the first Catholic parish built for African Americans on the west bank of New Orleans in Algiers. The parish was established in 1919 by the Josephite Priests at the request of the Archdiocese of New Orleans. The original wood frame building, now demolished, was built in 1920 to house both the church and the school. The current church building was constructed in 1931 to meet the demands of an ever-growing parish. The property includes three contributing buildings and one non-contributing building. The contributing buildings include the 1931 church, the 1921 rectory and a two-story modern school building (named for the church) where the original school once existed, built in 1952. Their styles include the mission style (church), craftsman style (rectory) and modern style (school). The non-contributing building is a small garage behind the rectory that has been altered. While the church is the primary focus of this nomination, the other buildings are integral to the story of this parish. At an unknown time, the red roof tiles on the church were replaced with red asphalt shingles. No other changes to the church are noted. The windows in the school and rectory have been altered as well. Despite these changes, the buildings have a good degree of integrity of location, design, setting, materials, feeling, and association.

All Saints Roman Catholic Church, School and Rectory are locally significant under Criterion A in the areas of religion, social history, education and ethnic heritage. It represents an important historical phenomenon in the history of the Catholic Church in southern Louisiana – the formation of separate churches for African-American parishioners. It meets the requirements for Criteria Consideration A (religious properties) because it is significant under a theme in the history of religion having secular scholarly recognition.

Guy Carwile requested that photos be numbered in the nomination and that wall thickness be added to the sketch plan. He also provided some suggestions for architecture terminology in the description. Lynn Lewis asked how the property fared in Hurricane Katrina. Ms. Harrison responded that the church suffered minor wind damage but served as a place of refuge for parishioners on the east bank of the river because the area did not flood. Mr. Lewis also asked if the mural behind the altar was painted directly onto the brick wall. Ms. Harrison stated that she believed the muralist had painted directly onto the wall, possibly applying a coating to smooth out the surface beforehand. Turry Flucker asked if the church was still under the leadership of the Josephites. Ms. Harrison stated that it is. Gabrielle Begue asked if the architect was known. Emily Ardoin responded that the architect was Alexander W. Norman.

Turry Flucker then moved that the nomination be recommended to the SHPO and Guy Carwile seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

U.S. Quarantine Station – New Orleans, Orleans Parish

Presented by Kelly Calhoun, nomination preparer

Located on the banks of the Mississippi River in the Algiers community of New Orleans, Orleans Parish, Louisiana, the U.S. Quarantine Station – New Orleans is a collection of six buildings that were built by the United States Public Health Service (PHS) between 1930 and 1931 for quarantining incoming ships and crewmen. The station, located on the west bank of the Mississippi River in the New Orleans neighborhood of Algiers, began as an eighteen-building complex. Today, six original buildings remain after parts of the complex were sold off and subsequently demolished at various times beginning in the 1970s. The remaining buildings of the U.S. Quarantine Station – New Orleans today sits on 3.03+/- land, including one and two-story buildings totaling 19,225 gross square feet. The nomination includes the six original buildings nearest the levee: the

Office, Garage/Shop, Fumigation and Disinfectant Plant, Garage, Attendants' Quarters and the Sewerage Disposal and Pumping Station.

The U.S. Quarantine Station – New Orleans is significant under Criterion A in the area of health and medicine. The campus represents a time in early- to mid-20th century America when immigration and certain epidemic diseases were of grave concern to public health. Built in 1931 by the Public Health Service (PHS) as a response to the bustling activity of the nearby Port of New Orleans, the U.S. Quarantine Station - New Orleans is an example of a facility dedicated to protecting the American people from communicable disease and the building types necessary to support this purpose. The remaining buildings reflect state, local and national attention to disease control and safe commercial importations. The architect, Louis Adolphe Simon, designed several Colonial Revival structures for the U.S. Government throughout his career.

Guy Carwile provided proofreading suggestions as well as suggestions for architecture terminology in the description. He suggested that a photo depicting the aggregate concrete on the lamp posts be included. Dr. Saunders requested the addition of a unit of measurement in the acreage description. Lynn Lewis asked whether all the remaining lamp posts are within the district boundary. Emily Ardoin responded that some extant lamp posts remain outside the nomination boundary but the 4 described in the nomination are within the boundary. Mr. Lewis asked if any original lamp posts are missing within the boundary. Ms. Ardoin responded that she and Ms. Calhoun would confirm this.

Martha Salomon then moved that the nomination be recommended to the SHPO and Ava Allmont seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Odd Fellows Hall, St. Charles Grand Lodge #2842, St. Charles Parish

Presented by Kathy Hunter, co-nomination preparer

The St. Charles Grand Lodge #2842 Odd Fellows Hall is located on the west bank of the Mississippi River in Hahnville, LA. It is approximately one mile west of the parish seat and historic Homeplace Plantation. The Odd Fellows Hall is nestled in a quiet residential neighborhood. This simple two-story wood frame rectangular building was erected in 1899 by the St. Charles Grand Lodge Order of Odd Fellows #2842. It replaced an earlier hall constructed in 1895. The building sits on a pier-and-beam foundation with brick piers, a mix of wood clapboard and asbestos shingle siding, and a corrugated metal roof. The building still contains cypress lumber commonly used in the late 1800s and early 1900s in Louisiana and St. Charles Parish. The hall has seen some alterations including replaced windows in original openings, replaced front steps, asbestos siding on the side elevations, and some new interior finishes. Many of these alterations were made during the period of significance. The building has a high degree of integrity of location, setting, feeling, and association and a sufficient degree of integrity of design, materials, and workmanship to remain eligible for National Register listing.

The St. Charles Grand Lodge #2842 is significant under Criterion A at the local level in the areas of ethnic heritage and social history. Beyond its use as a meeting hall for the local Odd Fellows and House of Ruth chapters, it served as one of the only facilities in Hahnville that was available to African-Americans for social functions and other activities through the first half of the twentieth century. For this reason, the hall was the center of social life in Hahnville for the African-American community throughout its period of significance.

Guy Carwile requested that wall thickness be added to the sketch plan and made some suggestions for architecture terminology in the description. Rose P. LeGaux and Leroy Hunter were in attendance in support of the nomination.

Dr. Saunders then moved that the nomination be recommended to the SHPO and Turry Flucker seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Downtown Lafayette Civic Complex, Lafayette Parish

Presented by Gabrielle Begue, nomination preparer

The Downtown Lafayette Civic Complex comprises 4 historic buildings located on a triangular-shaped block in downtown Lafayette, Lafayette Parish, Louisiana: 1) a former federal courthouse and United States Post Office (1960/1965), 2) the former Lafayette City Hall (1939), 3) the former Administration Building constructed as an annex to City Hall (1955-56), and 4) the former Lafayette Public Library (1953). These buildings served as the center of civic-related activity during the post-World War II period, when Lafayette grew exponentially from a small town into the urban center of Southwest Louisiana. The surrounding setting is characterized by a mix of commercial, institutional, and civic buildings dating from the early through the late 20th century. The 4 buildings possess a high degree of integrity overall, particularly on the exteriors; minor alterations include the installation of some interior partitions and updated finishes related to changes in use, and the replacement of windows and exterior doors at the former city hall. In addition to these alterations, the federal courthouse building has suffered damage due to long-term water intrusion, particularly on the upper floors. Nevertheless, all of the buildings remain readily identifiable from their period of significance and, therefore, are eligible for listing as a complex in the National Register.

The buildings associated with the Downtown Lafayette Civic Complex are significant at the local level under Criterion A in the area of community planning and development as the center of civic activity in Lafayette and as symbols of the city's extraordinary growth in the post-World War II period. As a complex, it represents Lafayette's optimism, prosperity, and progress as the city transformed from a small town into the urban center of Southwest Louisiana. The period of significance begins in 1939, with the completion of the new Lafayette City Hall, and ends in 1969, the current 50-year cut-off.

There were no questions or comments from the committee. Dr. Saunders moved that the nomination be recommended to the SHPO and Turry Flucker seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Railroad-Related Industrial and Commercial Buildings on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor, 1900-1969 Multiple Property Submission, Orleans Parish and 2 individual nominations: 1601 Lafitte Avenue & 1621 Lafitte Avenue Presented by John Williams, project architect

The "Railroad-Related Industrial and Commercial Buildings on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor, 1900-1969" multiple property listing represents a distinctive body of property types located along the Southern Railway System's main line into downtown New Orleans that developed over the course of the 20th century. The Southern Railway (SR) was among the most prominent trunk lines that entered the city and played a significant role in port-related commerce and local industrial/commercial enterprises. The listing includes two historic contexts:

- I. Evolution of Railroad Transportation in Orleans Parish, 1830-1969
- II. History of the Southern Railway System in Orleans Parish, 1900-1969

These two historic contexts possess a local level of significance, and individual properties may be significant at the national, state, or local level.

Associated property types for "Railroad-Related Industrial and Commercial Buildings on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor, 1900-1969" are based on associative qualities and physical characteristics relating to the buildings' historic uses or functions. This document identifies one associated property type, Industrial Facilities and Commercial Distribution Buildings, and two associated property subtypes, A) Industrial Manufacturing Facilities and Warehouses and B) Commercial Warehouses.

The significance of this property type and sub-types is their association with the history of the Lafitte Greenway Corridor as the main line of the Southern Railway System into New Orleans. The introduction of SR's main line along the near-obsolete Carondelet Canal at the turn of the century created an industrial hub in the heart of the city that persisted well into the post-World War II period. As such, the property type and sub-types reflect SR's important role in the evolution of railroad-related manufacturing, wholesale distribution, and warehousing businesses in New Orleans and the expansion of these types of business into the "back-of-town" area, where such development had been thwarted by the limited capacity of the canal. They have direct associations with

the historic contexts “The Evolution of Railroad Transportation in Orleans Parish, 1830-1969” and “History of the Southern Railway System in Orleans Parish, 1900-1969.” All date from the period of significance, 1900-1969. The property subtypes are eligible under Criterion A in the areas of Industry and/or Commerce as important surviving examples of industrial and commercial development of the Lafitte Greenway Corridor.

1601 Lafitte Avenue was constructed in 1950-51 on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor by R. E. Mestayer Lumber Company as a building materials/lumber warehouse with close proximity to the Southern Railway System (SR) main line. Rectilinear in form and constructed of concrete block and steel, the building is 1 story in height and strictly utilitarian in appearance, with shallow-pitched gables on the façade and rear elevation that dominate the building’s street presence. The building sits at the corner of Lafitte Avenue and N. Robertson Street and fronts on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor/Richard B. Lemann Memorial Park; the rear of the property is bordered by St. Peter Street and the Interstate-10 off-ramp, and to the northwest is N. Claiborne Avenue. In addition to its intact setting near SR’s tracks, the building is surrounded by other industrial and commercial warehouse facilities, which together formed the industrial hub that defined the corridor for much of the 20th century. In 2017, the building underwent a rehabilitation designed according to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation to qualify for historic rehabilitation tax incentives. The exterior remains largely unchanged since its construction, except for the replacement of asbestos cladding with non-hazardous metal and translucent panels and the replacement of doors and windows with compatible new units. These types of alterations are common to this property type and do not significantly impact the building’s overall integrity. Intact interior features include exposed fireproof roof and wall structure and an open feel via reversible, partial-height wall partitions. Due to its overall level of integrity, 1601 Lafitte Avenue is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

1601 Lafitte Avenue is significant at the local level under Criterion A in the area of commerce for its association with the history of the Southern Railway in New Orleans and its impact on both the cityscape and local commerce following World War II. This 1950s warehouse, which was constructed as a small local business during the post-World War II boom years of the Lafitte Greenway Corridor, is one of the comparatively few intact resources remaining to communicate this important history. It is directly associated with the multiple property listing “Railroad-Related Industrial and Commercial Buildings on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor, 1900-1969” and its historic context “History of the Southern Railway System in Orleans Parish, 1900-1969,” and it meets the registration requirements of Property Subtype – Commercial Warehouses found in Section F of the MPS cover. The period of significance begins in 1950, when construction began on the building, and ends in 1969, the 50-year cut-off.

The industrial facility at 1621 Lafitte Avenue is located on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor with close proximity to the Southern Railway System (SR) main line. The property consists of an aggregate of building sections constructed in various stages and located on several lot remnants. Today, these remnants are united as Lot S-1, an L-shaped parcel with street-facing elevations on Lafitte Avenue, N. Claiborne Avenue, and N. Robertson Street. The various building sections date primarily from the 1940s to the 1960s and are all fireproof construction; the 1940s section originally served as part of an ice cream factory, and the rest as Econo-Meat Mart, a meat cutting, storage, and retail business. Devoid of unique architectural references, the building is strictly utilitarian and functional in form. In addition to its intact setting near SR’s tracks, the building is surrounded by other industrial and commercial warehouse facilities, which together formed the industrial hub that defined the corridor for much of the 20th century. In 2017, the building underwent a rehabilitation that was designed according to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation to qualify for historic rehabilitation tax credits. The exterior remains largely unchanged in appearance since its construction, except for the replacement of some doors and windows with compatible units and the introduction of some additional window openings. The interior has been converted into offices; intact features include exposed roof structure, some exposed concrete block and brick walls, intact defining boundary walls of the various building sections, and visible meat racks. Despite the alterations, the building remains recognizable as a historic, mid-20th-century industrial facility and, as such, is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

1621 Lafitte Avenue is significant at the local level under Criterion A in the area of industry as one of the few remaining examples of a mid-20th century industrial facility on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor. It is directly associated with the multiple property listing “Railroad-Related Industrial and Commercial Buildings on the Lafitte Greenway Corridor, 1900-1969” and its historic context “History of the Southern Railway System in

Orleans Parish, 1900-1969” and meets the registration requirements of Property Subtype – Industrial Manufacturing Facilities and Warehouses found in Section F of the MPS cover. The period of significance begins c. 1952, when construction began on the Econo-Meat Mart facility, and ends in 1969, the 50-year cut-off.

John Williams noted during his presentation that 1601 and 1621 Lafitte Avenue were previously nominated in 2016 and were denied by the National Park Service (NPS) with comments that the significance arguments did not relate to the buildings and the buildings lacked sufficient integrity. John Sykes asked if the previous nominations were included in a Multiple Property Submission. Mr. Williams responded that they were previously nominated individually without a Multiple Property Submission (MPS). He noted that the new nomination focuses more on the location and the history of the surrounding community overall as well as the history related to the Southern Railway Corridor and the Lafitte Greenway, and he hopes NPS will reconsider the properties with this additional information as well as reevaluating some of the information included in the original nomination. John Sykes asked Emily Ardoin how many properties would be affected by the Multiple Property Submission. Ms. Ardoin noted that the MPS identifies 32 potentially eligible properties. John Williams added that the original number would have been around 150, but only the 32 buildings are still extant. Guy Carwile requested that a map of the geographic area be included in the MPS nomination as well as photos of the 32 buildings identified. Mr. Carwile asked if tax credits could still be obtained even though rehabilitation work has been completed. Mr. Williams responded that they could. Mr. Carwile asked whether Mr. Williams was the architect for the rehabilitation work and complimented the work. Mr. Williams noted that the owner of the buildings, Michael Valentino, was in attendance. Dr. Saunders asked whether the individual nominations would depend on whether NPS approved the MPS. Emily Ardoin responded that if the MPS were returned, the individual nominations would automatically be returned with it. She also noted that if the MPS were returned, the individual nominations could also be revised to add more context and resubmitted without the MPS cover document. Dr. Saunders noted that she remembered the previous nominations and that the presentation was clearer this time. Dr. Savage noted that he also remembered the previous nominations and previous discussion about the integrity of the buildings, but he felt the new presentation made a much clearer argument for eligibility. John Sykes asked if the new nominations had received any prior feedback from NPS. Ms. Ardoin responded that the properties had gone through the PDIL process with NPS and were denied with feedback related to both significance and integrity. Ava Alltmont asked if all 32 properties would be listed individually. Ms. Ardoin responded that the 32 properties were identified only as other properties that could fit the theme of the MPS; they would have to be nominated individually in order to be listed. Ms. Ardoin further explained that while a district is a collection of properties that are nominated as a group, an MPS establishes a common context under which separate properties can be nominated individually; therefore, each property nominated under an MPS must be individually eligible. Ms. Ardoin also noted that a letter of support had been received.

Dr. Savage then moved that the nominations be recommended to the SHPO and Dr. Saunders seconded. There were eight yays and one nay. The motion passed.

Emily Ardoin announced that the next Review Committee meeting will be held December 5, 2019.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 12:49PM.